

MINUTES OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING FOR TENDER BMSIC/REAGENT/18-02

(TENDER FOR RATE CONTRACT & SUPPLY OF CLINICAL BIOCHEMISTRY REAGENT (IN VITRO DIAGNOSTICS MEDICAL DEVICES) FOR SEMI AUTO BIOCHEMISTRY ANALYZERS AND FULLY AUTO BIOCHEMISTRY ANALYZERS INSTALLED THROUGH BMSICL AT DIFFERENT HEALTHCARE FACILITIES OF STATE OF BIHAR FOR THE YEAR 2018-2020.)

Date: 04th January 2019

Venue: BMSICL Conference Hall.

The Technical Evaluation Committee Meeting for Tender No. BMSIC/REAGENT/18-02 was held on 04th January 2019 under the chairmanship of Dr. R. D. Ranjan, Director in Chief, Department of Health, GoB. The other committee members present in the meeting were:

- 1. Sh. Anil Kumar, Joint Secretary, Department of Health, GoB.
- 2. Sh. Khalid Arshad, AO, State Health Society; GoB.
- 3. Dr. N. K. Mishra, Additional Director, Department of Health, GoB
- 4. Sh. Sudhir Kumar, GM (Procurement), BMSICL.
- 5. Sh. Sunil Kumar Singh, GM (Logistics), BMSICL.
- 6. Dr. Biswaprakash Pradhan, DGM (Drugs), BMSICL.

The Details of the invited tender are as follows:

- 1. Tender Reference No. BMSIC/REAGENT/18-02
- 2. Tender floated date- 11/07/2018
- 3. Last date of submission of Online bids-13/09/2018
- 4. Tender opening date- 14/09/2018

The Tender has been floated for the following Forty-One (41) Number Clinical Biochemistry Reagents along with certain complimentary services as enumerated in clause 20(a) of the tender document.

	TENDER PRODUCT LIST							
Sl. No	Name of the Clinical Biochemistry Reagents	SI. No	Name of the Clinical Biochemistry Reagents					
1	Acid Phosphatase	22	Total Iron Binding Capacity (TIBC)					
2	Alanine Aminotransferase (ALT)/SGPT	23	Lactate Dehydrogenase (LDH)					
3	Albumin	24	Magnesium					
4	Alkaline Phosphate		Phosphorus					
5	Amylase	26	RF Quantitative					

Madhus

Page 1 of 16

4th Floor, Bihar State Building Construction Corporation Limited Hospital Road, Shastri Nagar, Patna-800 023 Phone/Fax: +91-612 2283287, +91 612 2283288 www.bmsicl.gov.in

for fairs





6	Apolipo A1	27	Total Bilirubin
7	Apolipo B	28	Total Protein
8	ASO Quantitative	29	Triglycerides
9	Aspartate Aminotransferase (SGOT)	30	Urea
10	Total Calcium	31	Uric Acid
11	Total Cholesterol	32	Urine Microalbumin
12	Cholinesterase	33	Urine Microprotein
13	Creatinine	34	Lipase
14	CRP Quantitative	35	(Creatinine Kinase) CPK
15	Direct Bilirubin	36	Creatinine Kinase-MB (CK-MB)
16	D-HDL Cholesterol	37	Creatinine Kinase-NAC (CK-NAC)
17	D-LDL Cholesterol	38	Ferritin
18	Gamma Glutamyl transferase	39	Compliment C3
19	Glucose (minimum 400ml)	40	Compliment C4
20	HBA1C	41	Amylase Pancreatic
21	Iron (Fe)		1

Total 5 (Five) bidders have participated in the tender, the list is as follows:

- 1. M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd.
- 2. M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd.
- 3. M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd.
- 4. M/s Kopran Laboratories Limited
- 5. M/s LabX

The Preliminary Evaluation of technical bids of the above-mentioned bidding firms was done by the team of Drug Inspectors deputed at BMSICL. Evaluation sheets were published on the website of BMSICL and clarifications were invited from the respective firms vide notice 3008 dated 01-10-2018.

After comparison of the clarifications received in the light of that notice from the bidders and close examination of the documents submitted by the bidding firms, the bidder wise technical evaluation findings were recorded as follows in the TEC meeting dated 29-10-2018.

Page 2 of 16

4th Floor, Bihar State Building Construction Corporation Limited Hospital Road, Shastri Nagar, Patna-800 023 Phone/Fax: +91-612 2283287, +91 612 2283288 www.bmsicl.gov.in

In joils





S.N.	Name of the Bidder	Remarks
1	M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd.	The bidder has not submitted valid license in Form 10 for Glucose (NIT Sl. No. 19) to import drugs.
2	M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd.	The bidder has not submitted valid license in Form 10 for HBA1C (NIT Sl. No. 20) to import drugs.
3	M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd.	All submitted documents are not attested by the Authorized signatory, as required vide clause 3 (e) of Bid document. Bidder has submitted product approval only for 7 quoted items against the requirement of 41 items. As per Clause 3(h) of NIT, "The bidder shall produce copy/copies of executed supply order/orders for Biochemistry reagents worth minimum ten crore rupees on a cumulative basis during the last three years from the Central Government/ any state government/ any Central Government or State Government PSU- but the Bidder has not submitted the requisite documents.
	M/s Kopran Laboratories	Bidder has quoted for 20 products only against the requirement of 41 products. The bidder has not submitted valid license in Form 10 for
4	Limited Laboratories	Acid Phosphatase (NIT Sl. No. 1), Cholinesterase (NIT Sl. No. 12), Ferritin (NIT Sl. No. 38) to import drugs.
5	M/s LabX	According to Clause 3(f) of NIT, "The Bidder must have a valid manufacturing/import license but the bidder has not submitted valid license in form 10 for import any of the quoted products. 2) Certification from European-CE/USFDA has not been submitted for Acid Phosphatase (NIT Sl. No. 1), Urine Microprotein (NIT Sl. No. 33), (Creatinine Kinase) CPK (NIT Sl. No. 35) and Amylase Pancreatic (NIT Sl. No. 41) as required according to clause 3(f) of NIT". 3) As per Clause 3(h) of NIT, "The bidder shall produce copy/copies of executed supply order/orders for Biochemistry reagents worth minimum ten crore rupees on a cumulative basis during the last three years from the Central Government/ any state government/ Any Central Government or State Government PSU- but the Bidder has not submitted the requisite documents.

Page 3 of 1/6



Considering the fact that after publication of preliminary evaluation sheets on the web-portal of BMSICL, the bidders had clarified many of the points raised by the evaluators and further considering the volume of the documents required to be submitted, it was unanimously decided in the TEC meeting dated 29/10/2018 to give them another but last opportunity to all the bidders to submit their clarification on the above mentioned points and further submit the missing documents (if any). It was also decided to upload the minutes of this meeting on the website of BMSICL and to intimate the respective bidders individually also through e-mail, to allow them for clarification and submission of missing documents within 7 (seven) days.

Accordingly, the minutes of that meeting was published on the website of the BMSICL along with a notice bearing notice no. 3577 dated 01-11-2018 to invite claims/objections and the bidders were also intimated through mail.

In the light of the above said notice dated 01.11.2018, the following claims/objections were received till the last date of the scheduled period and those claims and objections were evaluated in the TEC meeting dated 08-11-2018 and disposed off in that meeting as follows:-

S. N.	Name of the Claimant/ Objector	Date and time of receipt of claim/ Objection	Claim/Objection in Brief	Suppor ting docum ents if any	Disposal of the claim/Objection	Remarks
1	Atul	08-11-	1. M/s Abbott	Not	M/s Abbott Healthcare	M/s Abbott
	Kumar	2018	Diagnostics Pvt. Ltd	Given	Pvt Ltd. has given the	Healthcare
	Singh	(8:29AM)	has submitted the bid		requisite import license	Pvt. Ltd. is
	through		only to complete the		and fulfilled the	technically
	atulkumar		tender procedure		required criteria as per	qualified.
	singhpnb0		formalities. They are		the terms and	
	9@gmail.c		not at all manufacturing		conditions laid down in	
	om		OPEN system reagents,		the bid document.	
			neither for different		Hence, the objection is	
			make Auto Analyzer		not valid.	
			nor they make any			
			reagents for Semi			
			Automatic Reagents.			
			Requesting you, to			
9.			please inquire and take			
			the written confirmation			
		1	from them. After			
			confirmation from their			
			end, please put it in			
			your web portal about			
			their confirmation, so			
			that in feature NO			

Page 4 of 16







 		417	`
companies can do			
unethical practice in			
feature.			
2. POCT services	Not	Regarding	M/s POCT
limited is the only	Given		services Pvt
	Olvell	ingenuineness of the	
company who is getting		documents submitted	Ltd is
maximum order from		by the bidder, no	technically
BMSICL. It may in		evidence is submitted	qualified.
Diagnostics products or		by the objector.	
Hospital furniture, in			
spite of submitting the			
FALSE documents			
against your tender.			
Here, also they have			
submitted the FAKE			
documents like import			
documents and past			
order copies for			
reagents .They are			
manufacturing the			
reagents in India and			
supplying the same in			
your different Health			
Centre. Please enquire,			
there quoted reagents in			
last time and supplied			= =
reagents details. Even			
knowing the fact that			
in between (more than 1			- DOE
year) they did not have			
the valid IEC (import			
export code). But they			
quoted as a importer			
and produce all the			
FAKE documents. I			
am surprise to see, even			
they have done the			
same thing this time			
and try to play with			
BMSICL management			
as well as with the			
health of general people			
. 13			TOTAL / TOTAL TOTA



IIIh	(423)
	BMSICL
411	(A Govt. of Bihar undertaking)

-			To the state of th			(A Govt. of Bihar ur
			in Bihar. Please take			
			appropriate action.			
			3. Kopran Laboratories	Not	The objection against	M/s Koprai
			Ltd. has also quoted	Given	this firm has nothing to	Laboratories
			against your above		do with this tender.	Ltd. i
			mentioned tender and		Nevertheless as the firm	technically
			we are surprise to see		M/S Kopran	Disqualified
			that the same company		Laboratories Ltd has	-
			has also got the order		not fulfilled certain	
			for Auto Analyzer and		criteria as per the terms	
	700		they are not doing		and conditions laid	
			properly service for the		down in the bid	
			supplied instrument		document, this firm	
			after floating the		doesn't qualify	
			current tender. Please		technically.	
		13	inquire from your		toomicany.	
			different health			
			institute/ Hospital. If			
			they are not able to			
			maintain the Automated			
			Analyzer, how they will			
			supply the reagents for			
			whole state of Bihar.			
		5	Please inquire about			
			their service in last 6			
			months from different			
			Health			
			Centre/Hospitals.			
2	Umesh for	07-11-	1. M/s POCT Services	Not	A. M/s POCT services	M/s POCT
	Labxx	2018	Pvt. Ltd: Bidder has	Given	Pvt limited has now	Services Pv
]	kerala	(15:06	not submitted valid		submitted valid license	Ltd i
1	through	PM)	license in FORM 10 for		in Form 10 for Glucose.	technically
	labxx.kera	·	GLUCOSE.		B. Submitted	qualified.
	laindia@g		A. POCT Services Pvt.		documents (purchase	
	mail.com		Ltd is manufacturing		order) are in the name	
			the Glucose reagents in		of POCT Services Pvt.	
			India and they can't		Ltd. Hence, the	
			submit the valid license		objection is not valid.	
			in FORM 10 for		3	
			quoted GLUCOSE			
			parameters against			
			your tender.			
					7	
			B. You may have			2

Page **6** of **16**

4th Floor, Bihar State Building Construction Corporation Limited Hospital Road, Shastri Nagar, Patna-800 023 Phone/Fax: +91-612 2283287, +91 612 2283288

www.bmsicl.gov.in







			(11)	(A Govt. of Bihar unde
	overlook, that POCT			
	Services Pvt. Ltd has			
	not submitted the order			
	copies of Ten Crore on			
	a cumulative basis			
	during last 3 years. The			
	bidder has submitted			
	the order copies from			
	POCT Services - not			
	from POCT Service			
	Pvt. Ltd. Both			
	companies are different			
	and both are holding			
	different GST number.			
	Moreover POCT			
	Services Pvt. Ltd has			
	not submitted any			
	Name Change			
	certificates from Gov.			
	of UP or Delhi, against			
	your tender (from			
	POCT Services to			
	POCT Services Pvt			
	Ltd.) at the time of			
	tender submission.			
	2. Abott Healthcare Pvt.	Not	M/s Abbott Healthcare	M/s Abbott
	Ltd.: Non submission	Given	Pvt. Ltd has now	Healthcare
	valid license in FORM		submitted valid import	Pvt. Ltd. is
	10 for HbA1c.		license in FORM 10 for	technically
	A. Abbott Healthcare		HbA1c. M/s Abbott	qualified.
	does not have FORM		Diagnostics Pvt Ltd.	
	10 for HbA1c.		has fulfilled the	
	B. Abbott Healthcare		required criteria as per	
	Pvt. Ltd is		the terms and	
	manufacturing the		conditions laid down in	
	reagents for their		the bid document.	
	Automated Chemistry		Hence, the objection is	
	Analyser ONLY. This		not valid.	
	reagents pack are only			
	fitted in their Chemistry			
	Analyser. Moreover,			
	they do not have any			
Į,	semi auto analyser		2	

odker







		(111)	(A Govt. of Bihar und
reagents till date (you			
can find from their			
website). Please			
confirm by mail or in		' ' ' ! !	
person or by call from			
Abbott Healthcare Pvt			
Ltd that whether they			
are manufacturing the			
chemistry reagents for			
different automated			
chemistry analyser and			
semi automated			
analyser or not. Please			
take it written			
confirmation from			
Abbott Healthcare and			
we assure you that they			
are not in a position to			
reply your quires. They			
will NOT reply your			
quires. R you going to			
take any steps for the			
same? They have just			
done participated for			
helping other bidder			
which is violence of			
CVO guideline.			
3. Avantor	Not	Avantor Performance	M/s Avantor
Performance Materials	Given	Materials and India Ltd	Performance
and India Ltd. Bidder		has not fulfilled the	Materials and
has quoted few items	-1'-	required criteria as per	India Ltd is
but all the quoted items		the terms and	technically
are having FORM 10.		conditions laid down in	Disqualified.
Regarding Ten Crore		the bid document.	
on a cumulative basis		Hence, the objection is	
during last 3 years, we		not valid.	
assure you that none of			
the bidder is having 10			
crore certificates except			
Abbott Healthcare Pvt.			
Ltd & Kopran			
Laboratories Limited.			

Bloodlas

Page 8 of 16







Services (hard copy submitted valid license in Form 10 (Licence no.NCD-117/16, valid upto 05/07/2019) for Glucose (NIT Sl. No. 19) to import drugs. 4 M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd. M/s Abont Healthcare Pvt. Ltd. M/s Avantor Performan ce Performan ce Materials and India Ltd. Avantor Performan ce Materials and India Ltd. M/s Avantor Performan ce Materials and India Ltd. M/s Avantor Performan ce Materials and India Ltd. M/s Mobility M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd. has declared that they have provided all certificates/documents required to comply with the Medical device rules 2017 for supply of Invitro Diagnostics devices. But in the later mail it has declared that, it has quoted only for 20 items out of 41. M/s Avantor Performanc Materials and India Ltd. has declared that they have provided all certificates/documents required to comply with the Medical device rules 2017 for supply of Invitro Diagnostics devices. But in the later mail it has declared that, it has quoted only for 20 items out of 41.						- this	(A Govt. of Bihar unde
M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd. M/s Abantor Performan ce Materials and India Ltd. M/s Mos Materials and India Ltd. M/s Mos Mos Mos Mos Mos Mos Mos Mos Mos Mo		Services	(hard copy	submitted valid license in Form 10 (Licence no.NCD-117/16, valid upto 05/07/2019) for Glucose (NIT Sl. No.	YES	fulfilled the required criteria as per the terms and conditions laid down in the bid document.	M/s POCT services Pvt limited is technically qualified.
M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd. has declared that they have provided all certificates/documents required to comply with the Medical device rules 2017 for supply of Invitro Diagnostics devices. But in the later mail it has declared that, it has quoted only for 20 items out of 41. M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd. has declared that they have provided all certificates/documents required to comply with the Medical device rules 2017 for supply of Invitro Diagnostics devices. But in the later mail it has declared that, it has quoted only for 20 items out of 41. documents are attested by Authorized signate as required vide cla 3 (e) of Bid docum Bidder has submi product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of the Nedical device shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Clause 2 of NIT, "The bid shall product approval of for 7 quoted its against the requirem of 41 ite 2). As per Cla	4	Abbott Healthcare	2018 (7:02	submitted valid license in Form 10 for HBA1C (NIT Sl. No. 20) to	YES	fulfilled the required criteria as per the terms and conditions laid down in the bid	M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd. is technically qualified.
documents	5	Avantor Performan ce Materials and India	2018 & 5:05 PM) and (08- 11-2018 &	Performance Materials and India Ltd. has declared that they have provided all certificates/documents required to comply with the Medical device rules 2017 for supply of Invitro Diagnostics devices. But in the later mail it has declared that, it has quoted only	YES	documents are not attested by the Authorized signatory, as required vide clause 3 (e) of Bid document. Bidder has submitted product approval only for 7 quoted items against the requirement of 41 items. 2) As per Clause 3(h) of NIT, "The bidder shall produce copy/copies of executed supply order/orders for Biochemistry reagents worth minimum ten crore rupees on a cumulative basis during the last three years from the Central Government/ any state government/ any central Government or State Government psubut the Bidder has not submitted the requisite	M/s Avantor Performance Materials and India Ltd is technically Disqualified for non- compliance of clause 3(e), 3(h) and 2(f) of the bid document.

Page 9 of 16

						(A Govt. of Bihar und
					3) Bidder has quoted	
					for 20 products only	
					against the requirement	
					of 41 products.	
					Avantor Performance	•
					Materials and India Ltd	
					has not fulfilled the	
					required criteria as per	
					the terms and condition	
					of the bid document.	
					Hence, the objection is	
_			TEL C 1 1 1 1 1 1		not valid.	
6			The firm has submitted		The bidder has not	
			the Form-10 from his		submitted valid license	
			principal for the		in Form 10 for Acid	
			following parameters		Phosphatase (NIT Sl.	
			i.e		No. 1), Cholinesterase	
			1)Acid Phosphate		(NIT Sl. No. 12),	
			2)Cholinesterase		Ferritin (NIT Sl. No.	
			3)Ferritin		38) to import these	
			including renewal		items. Hence, it has not	
			application details for		fulfilled the required	
			ACP (Ref no.		criteria as per the terms	M/s Kopran
			IMP/IVD/2018/6747		and condition of the bid	Laboratories
			dated 06/09/18 & for		document.	Ltd. is
			others reference		document.	technically
	M/s	06-11-				1
	Kopran		no.IMP/IVD/2018/6919	VEC		Disqualified
	Laboratori	2018 &	dated 19/09/18.	YES		for non-
	es Limited	5:48 PM	These parameters are			compliance
			imported origin and			of clause
			manufactured by			3(g) and $5(a)$
			Beckman Coulter			of the bid
			GmbH.			document.
			Beckman coulter India			
			Pvt Ltd is a subsidiary			
			of Beckman Coulter			
			GmbH and presently			
			Beckman coulter India			
			Pvt Ltd are having their			
			office in			
			India.Currently Kopran			
			Laboratories Ltd is			
			sourcing from Beckman			

Page **10** of **1/6**







		coulter India Pvt Ltd for		dh	
		above parameters.			
7	M/s LabX any claim or objection.	No clarification from the bidder.	NA	As per the minutes of TEC meeting dated 29-10-2018, the firm has not fulfilled the following criteria:- 1) According to Clause 3(f) of NIT, "The Bidder must have a valid manufacturing/import license but the bidder has not submitted valid license in form 10 for import any of the quoted products. 2) Certification from European-CE/USFDA has not been submitted for Acid Phosphatase (NIT SI. No. 1), Urine Microprotein (NIT SI. No. 33), (Creatinine Kinase) CPK (NIT SI. No. 35) and Amylase Pancreatic (NIT SI. No. 41) as required according to clause 3(f) of NIT". 3) As per Clause 3(h) of NIT, "The bidder shall produce copy/copies of executed supply order/orders for Biochemistry reagents worth minimum ten crore rupees on a cumulative basis during the last three years from the Central Government/ any state government/ any state government/ Any	M/s LabX. is technically Disqualified for nor compliance of clause 3(f), 3(g) and 3(h) of the bid document.





IIIh	(A)
	BMSICL
(III)	(A Govt. of Bihar undertaking)
vernment or	

	A Govt. of Billar under
Central Government or	
State Government PSU-	
but the Bidder has not	
submitted the requisite	
documents.	

Hence, it was unanimously decided to recommend for opening of the financial bids of the following technically qualified bidding firms-

- 1. M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd.
- 2. M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd.

In the light of that recommendation, the meeting of Financial Committee was called on 12-11-2018. But in the meanwhile, two objections were received against the TEC decision dated 08-11-2018. Hence, in the financial committee meeting dated 12/11/2018, the committee discussed about the objection which was received from Mr. Atul Kumar Singh through e-mail dated 12/11/2018 at 8:52 AM against M/s Abbott Healthcare Private Limited and M/s POCT Services Private Limited and the representation of M/s Kopran Laboratories Ltd. which was received through e-mail on 10/11/18 at 05:02 PM, against its technical disqualification. As the issues raised in the said e-mails were technical in nature, the financial committee recommended to examine the details on the technical ground and accordingly conduct a TEC meeting for disposal of the said objections before opening of financial bid.

Accordingly in the TEC meeting dated 15/11/18, the objector/ claimant Mr. Atul Kumar Singh, M/s Kopran Laboratories Ltd., M/s Abbott Healthcare Private Limited and M/s POCT Services Private Limited were also invited to attend and substantiate their claim/objections with evidence if any.

The objector/claimant Mr. Atul Kumar Singh represented through his mail dated 14/11/2018 at 9:08 AM that he would be unable to attend the meeting and requested for another opportunity to attend and to put forward his case in any future meeting with proper prior intimation.

Mr. Jayanta Kr. Hati of M/s Kopran Laboratories Ltd attended the TEC meeting dated 15/11/2018. He submitted two separate representations which in brief were as follows: -

1. "We have already submitted our valid import license and Form-10. We have also submitted the Form-10 from our Principal Beckman Coulter GmbH along with renewal application code number ((Ref. No. IMP/IVD/2018/6747 Dated 6.09.2018) & (IMP/IVD/2018/6919 Dated 19.09.2018) for the following three parameters:

Serial No. 1 Acid Phosphatase

Serial No. 12 Cholinesterase

Serial No. 38 Ferritin.

These parameters are imported origin and manufactured by Beckman Coulter GmbH. Beckman Coulter India Pvt Ltd subsidiary of Beckman Coulter GmbH and presently they are not having their

Page 12 of 16



07

- office in India. However, we do hereby confirm that we are also in the process to incorporate these parameters in our Form-10. We further assure you that we will be able to supply the above reagents from our principal, if the consideration made from your end".
- 2. "We thank you very much for the curtsey extended to the undersigned during the technical meeting which has held at your office today (15.11.2018). Refer to above mentioned tender, we request you to please consider our Technical bid. Kindly refer to C.V.C guideline 2006 page no. 14, para no. 4 "In another case for procurement of computer hardware consisting of several individual items, the offer of a firm was rejected as the 'Server' quoted was not meeting the specified requirements. Similarly, the offer of another firm was rejected as the 'Client Desktop' quoted by them was not as per specified requirement. Though only one individual item was unacceptable in both the offers, the entire offer of both the firms was rejected despite there being no such condition in the tender that disqualification in one item would result in disqualification of the tender as a whole. Referring to the cited guidelines, we hereby request you to kindly consider our technical bid for further process of the above mentioned tender."

The points raised in the first representation of M/s Kopran Laboratories Ltd had already been dealt with in the minutes of the meeting of this committee dated 08-11-2018 and it was technically disqualified for the said deficits. After reexamination of these points it was observed that no new facts have been put forward by the firm in its first representation. Hence, the firm still stood disqualified for the want of valid Import license for items namely, Acid Phosphatase (Serial No. 1), Cholinesterase (Serial No. 12) & Ferritin (Serial No. 38 of NIT).

Regarding the 2nd representation of the firm, it was unanimously decided to take legal opinion on the issues of: -

- 1. Applicability of the above said para of the said guidelines to this tender in general and to the applicant in particular.
- 2. Whether the firm could be treated partially qualified for 38 items and partially disqualified for rest 3 items in the light of the above guidelines as well as in the light of the tender clause especially clause no. 20(a), 14(e) and 2(f).

Accordingly, the legal opinion was sought. The legal opinion has been recorded as-"In my opinion, the provision contained in the CVC guidelines is not applicable with respect to the instant tender in as much as the instant tender is a composite one as per clauses referred to above, each item cannot be segregated or the activities and other related functions. It is not based on individual item wise. It is composite with respect to supply of all the items and also for providing of man power, infrastructure, accessories, equipments and maintenance thereto. Having examined the matter, in my opinion, there is no error in the decision of the Technical Evaluation Committee and the said firm has rightly been held to be disqualified."

After considering the representation of Mr. Atul Kumar Singh, it was unanimously decided by the TEC on 15/11/2018 to provide another but last opportunity to attend and put forward the case in a future meeting with prior intimation. And accordingly vide mail dated 26/11/2018, he had been informed to attend this TEC meeting on 30/11/2018 to substantiate the objections/claims raised by him against the minutes of the

Page 13 of 16

4th Floor, Bihar State Building Construction Corporation Limited Hospital Road, Shastri Nagar, Patna-800 023 Phone/Fax: +91-612 2283287, +91 612 2283288

www.bmsicl.gov.in



meeting dated 08/11/2018. He was also informed that his raised claims/objections might be disposed off unilaterally by the committee if he fails to attend the scheduled TEC meeting.

But Mr. Atul Kumar Singh has neither attended nor submitted any document in support of his claims/objections. Despite that the points raised by the said complainant need to be verified and it was therefore decided to recommend for constitution of a fact finding committee to deeply enquire into the allegations made by the complainant against the technically qualified bidding firms namely M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd. and M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd., so that the matter could be brought to a logical conclusion.

- Thus the Internal Committee was formed under the chairmanship of Mr. Sunil Kumar Singh, GM (logistics), BMSICL. The other members of the committee were:-
 - 1. Sh. Biswaprakash Pradhan, DGM (Drugs)
 - 2. Mrs. Puja Sinha (Company Secretary)
 - 3. Sh. Mahesh Kumar Atri, (Manager Finance)
 - 4. Mr. Ravi Kiran Rakesh (Manager Drugs)
 - 5. Mr. Nitin Kumar (Asst. Manager Drugs)
 - 6. Mr. Rajesh Kumar (SRU)

The internal committee has submitted its findings and recommendations vide the minutes of its meeting dated 29.12.2018 which are in brief as follows:-

[The evaluation sheets submitted by the Drug Inspectors during their technical evaluation of this tender were thoroughly examined in the meeting of the Internal Committee on 10.12.2018. It was observed that during the technical evaluation all the papers submitted by the bidders had been technically examined, following which the two firms had been declared technically qualified.

However, in view of the complaint received, it was felt by the internal committee that the authenticity of the documents submitted by the firms, as a part of the technical bid needed to be authenticated on the basis of the verification of the corresponding original documents.

It was therefore unanimously decided by the internal committee to ask the technically qualified firms namely M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd. and M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd to be present in front of this committee on 17.12.2018 at 11:00 AM in BMSICL along with the original copy of the documents, submitted by the above said firms for the said tender. It was also decided to intimate the objector/ claimant Mr. Atul Kumar Singh, to attend and substantiate his claim/objections if any with evidence supported by an Affidavit on the above Scheduled meeting i.e 17.12.2018 at 11:00 AM in BMSICL.

Accordingly, vide letter no 4276 & 4275 dated 10.12.2018, M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd & M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd were informed respectively to appear in front of the internal committee on 17.12.2018 at 11:00 AM in BMSICL along with original copy of the documents submitted by the firm, as a part of the technical bid for the said tender, and same day a mail was also sent to the objector/ claimant Mr. Atul Kumar Singh to appear on 17.12.2018 before that committee and furnish supporting documents in favor of his claims/objections. He was also requested to furnish supporting documents (if any) under an affidavit through a speed post to BMSICL, if unable to appear at the scheduled meeting.

Page 14 of 16



But no response was received from M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd and Mr. Atul Kumar Singh.

M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd. also did not attend the scheduled meeting but it had requested for time through the following mail dated 13.12.2018 which reads as follows:- "This is with reference to your letter ref no. BMSIC/40020/28-2018/4276 dated 10.12.2018 regarding verification of the original documents before the Internal Committee. Owing to the fact we are a group our companies with multiple office locations and our documents are placed at different offices nationwide, thereby; it is a time taking process to collate all the documents at one instance. However, on your directions we have already initiated our process and would request you to please grant an extension of two days for furnishing the original documents before your committee. We hope you'll consider our request for this extension and would be grateful to you."

Accordingly, it was unanimously decided by the internal committee to provide another but last opportunity to the objector/ claimant Mr. Atul Kumar Singh, to either appear in person before it on 27.12.2018 at 11:00 AM in BMSICL to substantiate his claims/objections or send the true copies of evidence in support of his claims/objections by email.

Mr. Atul Kumar Singh neither attended nor submitted any document in support of his claims/objections on 27-12-2018 and even earlier.

It was also decided by the internal committee to ask M/s POCT Services Pvt. Ltd & M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt. Ltd to be present before the Internal Committee on 27.12.2018 at 11:00 AM in BMSICL along with original copy of the documents submitted by them as a part of the technical bid for the said tender, intimating them that this will be the last opportunity for them in view of the urgency of procurement of reagents and allied services as mentioned in clause 20(a) of the NIT.

Accordingly, on 27.12.2018 M/s POCT Services Pvt Ltd attended the meeting of the internal committee through its representative Mr. Vinay Mishra (RSM). As per the original copy of the documents furnished by him, it was found that the documents submitted (including the clarifications) were true copies of their original documents. Hence the allegations made by the complainant against this firm were found without substance and the internal committee has recommended to reject the same.

M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd also attended the meeting of the internal committee through its authorized representative Mr. Inderjit Singh (KAM-ADD). He has represented in front of the internal committee that M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd is a group of companies with multiple/global office locations and their documents are placed in those offices complying to their statuary policies. Consequent upon this, it becomes a time consuming process to collate all the original documents in a single instance and requesting to grant an extension of at least three (3) months, thus, enabling them to aggregate all the documents in original for their submission/ presentation before the committee. He promised before the internal committee to communicate the same thing on letterhead of M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd by 29.12.2018.

It was therefore decided by the internal committee to wait for the official communication from M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd and to finalise the proceeding of its meeting on 29.12.2018.

Page 15 of 16



Accordingly, M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd has communicated to BMSICL on its office letterhead vide its mail dated 29.12.2018 affirming its stand taken before the internal committee on 27-12-2018 and requested for extension of time period of 3 months for submission of original documents for verification.

In view of the above mentioned facts as well as in view of the fact that, the rate contract for Clinical Biochemistry Reagent (IN VITRO DIAGNOSTICS MEDICAL DEVICES) for semi auto biochemistry analyzers and fully auto biochemistry analyzers has expired since 09.11.2018 and considering the urgent requirement of the Clinical Biochemistry Reagent across the state, the Internal committee has recommended that it would not be advisable to grant an extension of 3 months to M/s Abbott Healthcare Pvt Ltd for submission of original documents and then to find the authenticity of the documents those submitted during the online bid submission, as during this period a fresh tender could be called upon and finalized.]

After perusal of the findings and agreeing with the recommendations of the Internal Committee, it was unanimously decided to recommend for cancellation of this tender and to re-invite the tender for the Biochemistry reagents and allied services necessary for providing uninterrupted diagnostic services at the health institutions of the state where semi and fully auto biochemistry analysers have been provided by the BMSICL.

With this decision, the meeting was concluded with a vote of thanks.

(Dr. Biswaprakash Pradhan)

DGM (Drugs), BMSICL, Patna

(Sh. Sunil Kumar Singh)

GM (Logistics), BMSICL, Patna)

1

(Dr. N. K. Mishra) Additional Director, Health Dept.,

Govt. of Bihar.

0

(Khalid Arshad)

Administrative Officer, SHSB.

(Sh. Anil Kumar)

(Sudhir Kumar)

GM (Procurement), BMSICL, Patna.

Joint Secretary, Health Dept. Govt. of Bihar.

(Dr. R.D. Ranjan)

Director in Chief, Health Dept.

Govt. of Bihar.

Page 16 of 16

4th Floor, Bihar State Building Construction Corporation Limited Hospital Road, Shastri Nagar, Patna-800 023 Phone/Fax: +91-612 2283287, +91 612 2283288 www.bmsicl.gov.in

Jan &

